

# Zygon<sup>®</sup>

*Journal of*  
RELIGION & SCIENCE



DECEMBER 2019  
VOLUME 54 NUMBER 4

*Founding Editor:* RALPH WENDELL BURHOE (1911–1997)

*Editor:* ARTHUR C. PETERSEN, University College London, UK

*Book Review Editor:* MLADEN TURK, Elmhurst College, USA

*Assistant Editor:* DEBRA HOSTETLER VAN DER MOLEN

*Editorial Assistant and Web Site Editor:* DAVID MARK GLOVER

*Joint Publication Board, appointed by IRAS (www.iras.org), the Institute on Religion in an Age of Science (1954), and by CASIRAS (www.casiras.org), the Center for Advanced Study in Religion and Science (1972), which also supports the Zygon Center (www.zygoncenter.org):*

WILLEM B. DREES, Prof. of Philosophy of the Humanities, Tilburg Univ., The Netherlands  
SOLOMON H. KATZ, Prof. of Anthropology, Univ. of Pennsylvania (co-chair), USA  
EDWIN C. LAURENSEN, Lawyer, McDermott Will & Emery LLP, San Francisco, USA  
KARL PETERS, Prof. Emeritus of Philosophy and Religion, Rollins College (co-chair, development), USA  
MICHAEL RUSE, Lucyle T. Werkmeister Prof. of Philosophy, Florida State Univ., USA  
GAYLE E. WOLOSCIAK, Prof. of Radiology and Cell and Molecular Biology, Northwestern Univ., USA

*Editorial Advisory Board:*

FRANCISCO J. AYALA, Donald Bren Professor of Biological Sciences, Univ. of California Irvine, USA  
ZAINAL ABDIN BAGIR, Center for Religious and Cross-Cultural Studies, Gadjah Mada University, Indonesia  
ANINDITA N. BALSLEV, Philosophy & Forum, 'Cross Cultural Conversation', India and Denmark  
JOSEPH BULBULIA, Evolutionary/Longitudinal Study of Religion, Victoria Univ., New Zealand  
RONALD COLE-TURNER, H. Parker Sharp Chair of Theology and Ethics, Pittsburgh Theological Seminary, USA  
MIHALY CSIKSZENTMIHALYI, Davidson Prof. of Psychology, Claremont Graduate Univ., USA  
TERRENCE DEACON, Prof. of Biological Anthropology and Linguistics, Univ. of California Berkeley, USA  
CELIA DEANE-DRUMMOND, Prof. of Theology, University of Notre Dame, USA  
GEORGE ELLIS, Prof. of Applied Mathematics, Univ. of Cape Town, South Africa  
DIRK EVERS, Prof. of Systematic Theology, Martin-Luther-University Halle-Wittenberg, Germany  
OWEN J. FLANAGAN, James B. Duke Prof. of Philosophy, Psychology, and Neuroscience, Duke Univ., USA  
MOHAMMED GHALY, Prof. of Islamic Law and Biomedical Ethics, Center for Islamic Legislation and Ethics, Doha, Qatar  
URSULA GOODENOUGH, Prof. of Biology, Washington Univ., St. Louis, USA  
NIELS HENRIK GREGERSEN, Prof. of Systematic Theology, Univ. of Copenhagen, Denmark  
NIDHAL GUESSOUM, Prof. of Physics and Astronomy, American University of Sharjah, United Arab Emirates  
PETER HARRISON, Director, Centre for the History of European Discourses, University of Queensland, Australia  
PHILIP HEFNER, Prof. Emeritus of Systematic Theology, Lutheran School of Theology at Chicago, USA  
MICHAEL S. HOGUE, Associate Prof. of Theology, Meadville Lombard Theological School, Chicago, USA  
ANTJE JACKELÉN, Archbishop of the Lutheran Church of Sweden, Uppsala, Sweden  
SELUNG CHUL KIM, Systematic Theology, Nanzan University, Japan  
MELVIN J. KONNER, Samuel Candler Dobbs Prof. of Anthropology, Emory Univ., USA  
LI JIANHUI, Prof. of Philosophy and Ethics, School of Philosophy and Sociology, Beijing Normal University, China  
LIU XIAOTING, Prof. of Sciences and Humanities, Beijing Normal University, China  
LU FENG, Ethics and Practical Philosophy, Tsinghua Univ., China  
ANDREW B. NEWBERG, Thomas Jefferson Univ. Hospital, Philadelphia, USA  
ANN MILLIKEN PEDERSON, Prof. of Religion, Augustana College, Sioux Falls, USA  
GREGORY R. PETERSON, Philosophy of Religion, South Dakota State Univ., USA  
VARADARAJA V. RAMAN, Prof. Emeritus of Physics and Humanities, Rochester Institute of Technology, USA  
HOLMES ROLSTON, III, Prof. of Philosophy, Colorado State Univ., USA  
ROBERT J. RUSSELL, Ian G. Barbour Prof. of Theology and Science, Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, USA  
ROBERT A. SEGAL, Sixth Century Chair in Religious Studies, Univ. of Aberdeen, UK  
CHRISTOPHER SOUTHGATE, Senior Lecturer, Department of Theology, University of Exeter, UK  
ANN TAVES, Professor of Religious Studies, University of California at Santa Barbara, USA  
HAVA TIROSH-SAMUELSON, Irving and Miriam Lowe Prof. of Modern Judaism, Arizona State Univ., USA  
MARY EVELYN TUCKER, Comparative Religion and Ecology, Yale Univ., USA  
CLAUDIA VANNEY, Prof. of Physics and Philosophy, Universidad Austral, Argentina  
FRANS DE WAAL, C. H. Candler Prof. of Psychology, Director Living Links Center, Emory Univ., USA  
WESLEY J. WILDMAN, Professor of Philosophy, Theology, and Ethics, Boston Univ., USA  
AMOS YONG, Director of Center of Missiological Research, Fuller Theological Seminary, USA

**Statement of Perspective.** The word *zygon* means the yoking of two entities or processes that must work together. It is related to *zygote*—meaning the union of genetic heritage from sperm and egg, a union that is vital in higher species for the continuation of advancement of life. The journal *Zygon* provides a forum for exploring ways to unite what in modern times has been disconnected—values from knowledge, goodness from truth, religion from science. Traditional religions, which have transmitted wisdom about what is of essential value and ultimate meaning as a guide for human living, were expressed in terms of the best understandings of their times about human nature, society, and the world. Religious expression in our time, however, has not drawn similarly on modern science, which has superseded the ancient forms of understanding. As a result religions have lost credibility in the modern mind. Nevertheless some recent scientific studies of human evolution and development have indicated how long-standing religions have evolved well-winnowed wisdom, still essential for the best life. *Zygon's* hypothesis is that when long-evolved religious wisdom is yoked with significant recent scientific discoveries about the world and human nature, there results credible expression of basic meaning, values, and moral convictions that provides valid and effective guidance for enhancing human life. *Zygon* also publishes manuscripts that are critical of this perspective, as long as such papers contribute to a constructive reflection on scientific knowledge, human values, and existential meaning.

**Editorial Office and Book Review Office.** *Zygon* Editorial Office, 1100 E. 55th Street, Chicago, IL 60615-5112, U.S.A. Telephone +1 773-256-0671. E-mail [zygon@lstc.edu](mailto:zygon@lstc.edu). Web site [www.zygonjournal.org](http://www.zygonjournal.org).

**Manuscripts.** Please submit manuscripts prepared for anonymous review, an abstract of at most 160 words, and an author note online via <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/zygon>. For author guidelines, see [www.zygonjournal.org](http://www.zygonjournal.org).

**Electronic Access and Back Issues.** The journal, including all previous issues, is available at [www.wileyonlinelibrary.com](http://www.wileyonlinelibrary.com). Back issues are available from Wiley Blackwell Publishing, 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148, U.S.A. For back volumes in microfilm: University Microfilms, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106; microfiche from Kraus Microform, Route 100, Millwood, NY 10564.

**Indexes and Abstracts.** *Zygon* is indexed in the ATLA Religion Database ([www.atla.com](http://www.atla.com)). The contents are indexed or abstracted in *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*, *Book Review Index*, *Children's Book Review Index*, *Current Contents*, *Dietrich's Index Philosophicus*, *Family Index*, *Guide to Social Science and Religion*, *Humanities Index*, *I B Z—Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes—und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur*, *Internationale Bibliographie der Rezensionen Geistes—und Sozialwissenschaftlicher Literatur*, *Lancaster Index to Defence & International Security Literature*, *New Testament Abstracts*, *Periodicals Contents Index*, *Philosopher's Index*, *R I L M Abstracts of Music Literature*, *Religion Index One: Periodicals*, *Religious & Theological Abstracts*, *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*, *Russian Academy of Sciences Bibliographies*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Social Services Abstracts*, and *Sociological Abstracts*.

**Production Editor:** Aldreen Cruz ([ZYGO@wiley.com](mailto:ZYGO@wiley.com))

**Advertising.** For information and rates, contact Advertising Sales Representative, Wiley Blackwell, 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148; [corporatesalesusa@wiley.com](mailto:corporatesalesusa@wiley.com).

**Copyright.** Copyright and copying © 2019 Joint Publication Board of *Zygon*. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored, or transmitted in any form or by any means without prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to photocopy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users registered with their local Reproduction Rights Organization (RRO), e.g., Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, U.S.A. ([www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com)), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the RRO. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Special requests should be addressed to: [permissions@wiley.com](mailto:permissions@wiley.com).

**Disclaimer.** The Publisher and Editor cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences from the use of information in this journal. Views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher and Editor; neither does publication of advertisement constitute any endorsement by the Publisher or the Editor of the product advertised.

Printed in the United States of America by The Sheridan Press.

ISSN 0591-2385 (Print)

ISSN 1467-9744 (Online)

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: [www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/zygon](http://www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/zygon)

# IN THIS ISSUE

## EDITORIAL

- ARTHUR C. PETERSEN Teilhard's Silencing, Mutual Enhancement, and Historical Europe

## ARTICLES

- PANKAJ JAIN Climate Engineering from Hindu-Jain Perspectives  
GLEN MORAN Harun Yahya's Influence in Muslim Minority Contexts: Implications for Research in Britain, Europe, and Beyond
- MICHAEL FRISHKOPF Aesthetics, Creativity, and Mysticism: An Investigation of Three Modes of Consciousness  
AMY H. LEE Science and Religion as Languages: Understanding the Science–Religion Relationship Using Metaphors, Analogies, and Models
- MIKAEL LEIDENHAG The Blurred Line between Theistic Evolution and Intelligent Design

## TEILHARD AND THE HOLY OFFICE REVISITED

- KENNETH W. KEMP Teilhard de Chardin, the “Six Propositions,” and the Holy Office  
DAVID GRUMETT Teilhard, the Six Propositions, and Human Origins: A Response

## MUTUAL ENHANCEMENT BETWEEN SCIENCE AND RELIGION

- FRASER WATTS Mutual Enhancement between Science and Religion: In the Footsteps of the Epiphany Philosophers  
WILLIAM H. BEHARRELL Transformation and the Waking Body: A Return to Truth via our Bodies  
MARIUS DOROBANTU Moral Orthoses: A New Approach to Human and Machine Ethics  
YORICK WILKS Religion, Science, and Disenchantment in Late Modernity  
GALEN WATTS  
ROWAN WILLIAMS Epiphany Philosophers: Afterword

## THE HISTORIOGRAPHY OF SCIENCE AND RELIGION IN EUROPE

- JAUME NAVARRO Science and Religion in Nineteenth-Century Europe: Non-Anglo-American Perspectives  
KOSTAS TAMPAKIS “Science,” “Religion,” and “Science-and-Religion” in the Late Ottoman Empire  
M. ALPER YALÇINKAYA  
KOSTAS TAMPAKIS High Science and Natural Sciences: Greek Theologians and the Science and Religion Interactions (1832–1910)  
AGUSTÍN CEBA HERRERO “Serving God, Fatherland, and Language”: Alcover, Catalan, and Science  
JOAN MARCH NOGUERA  
JAUME NAVARRO Draper in Spain: The Conflicting Circulation of the Conflict Thesis  
NEIL TARRANT Science, Religion, and Italy's Seventeenth-Century Decline: From Francesco de Sanctis to Benedetto Croce

## CONTENTS

### EDITORIAL

Teilhard’s Silencing, Mutual Enhancement, and Historical Europe . . . . .	ARTHUR C. PETERSEN	823
--	--------------------	-----

### ARTICLES

Climate Engineering from Hindu-Jain Perspectives . . . . .	PANKAJ JAIN	826
Harun Yahya’s Influence in Muslim Minority Contexts: Implications for Research in Britain, Europe, and Beyond . . . . .	GLEN MORAN	837
Aesthetics, Creativity, and Mysticism: An Investigation of Three Modes of Consciousness . . . . .	MICHAEL FRISHKOPF	857
Science and Religion as Languages: Understanding the Science–Religion Relationship Using Metaphors, Analogies, and Models . . . . .	AMY H. LEE	880
The Blurred Line between Theistic Evolution and Intelligent Design . . . . .	MIKAEL LEIDENHAG	909

### TEILHARD AND THE HOLY OFFICE REVISITED

Teilhard de Chardin, the “Six Propositions,” and the Holy Office . . . . .	KENNETH W. KEMP	932
Teilhard, the Six Propositions, and Human Origins: A Response . . . . .	DAVID GRUMETT	954

### MUTUAL ENHANCEMENT BETWEEN SCIENCE AND RELIGION

Mutual Enhancement between Science and Religion: In the Footsteps of the Epiphany Philosophers . . . . .	FRASER WATTS	965
Transformation and the Waking Body: A Return to Truth via our Bodies . . . . .	WILLIAM H. BEHARRELL	984
Moral Orthoses: A New Approach to Human and Machine Ethics . . . . .	MARIUS DOROBANTU AND YORICK WILKS	1004
Religion, Science, and Disenchantment in Late Modernity . . . . .	GALEN WATTS	1022
Epiphany Philosophers: Afterword . . . . .	ROWAN WILLIAMS	1036

### THE HISTORIOGRAPHY OF SCIENCE AND RELIGION IN EUROPE

Science and Religion in Nineteenth-Century Europe: Non-Anglo- American Perspectives . . . . .	JAUME NAVARRO AND KOSTAS TAMPAKIS	1045
“Science,” “Religion,” and “Science-and-Religion” in the Late Ottoman Empire . . . . .	M. ALPER YALÇINKAYA	1050

High Science and Natural Sciences: Greek Theologians and the Science and Religion Interactions (1832–1910) . . . . .	KOSTAS TAMPAKIS 1067
“Serving God, Fatherland, and Language”: Alcover, Catalan, and Science . . . . .	AGUSTÍN CEBA HERRERO AND JOAN MARCH NOGUERA 1087
Draper in Spain: The Conflicting Circulation of the Conflict Thesis . . . . .	JAUME NAVARRO 1107
Science, Religion, and Italy’s Seventeenth-Century Decline: From Francesco de Sanctis to Benedetto Croce . . . . .	NEIL TARRANT 1125

## REVIEW

<i>Navigating Post-Truth and Alternative Facts: Religion and Science as Political Theology</i> edited by Jennifer Baldwin . . . . .	ARTHUR C. PETERSEN 1145
---	-------------------------

PATRONS . . . . .	1147
-------------------	------

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS . . . . .	1148
---------------------------	------

ANNOUNCEMENTS . . . . .	1149
-------------------------	------

- Visit us at [www.zygonjournal.org](http://www.zygonjournal.org) •

[*Zygon*, vol. 54, no. 4 (December 2019)]

© 2019 by the Joint Publication Board of *Zygon*. ISSN 0591-2385 (Print), ISSN 1467-9744 (Online)  
*Zygon* and its logo are registered trademarks.

**Information for Subscribers.** *Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science* is published quarterly by the Joint Publication Board of *Zygon*, 1100 East 55th Street, Chicago, IL 60615-5112, USA, phone +1-773-256-0671, e-mail [zygon@lstc.edu](mailto:zygon@lstc.edu), through Wiley Subscription Services, Inc., a Wiley company, 111 River St., Hoboken, NJ 07030-5774, USA.

**Subscription Prices.** Personal: print + online \$97/£86/€97; AAR members: print + online \$80/£66/€80; ISSR Fellows and Associates print + online \$80/£66/€80; Students: print + online \$61/£55/€61; Institutional: print + online \$515/£430/€541, print only \$412/£344/€433, online only \$412/£344/€433. Prices are exclusive of tax. Asia-Pacific GST, Canadian GST/HST, and European VAT will be applied at the appropriate rates. For more information on current tax rates, please go to [www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/tax-vat](http://www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/tax-vat). The price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1, 2015, where available. For other pricing options, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/library-info/products/price-lists>.

**Journal Customer Services:** For ordering information, claims, and any inquiries concerning your journal subscription please go to [www.wileycustomerhelp.com/ask](http://www.wileycustomerhelp.com/ask) or contact your nearest office.

**Americas:** Email: [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com); Tel: +1 781 388 8598 or +1 800 835 6770 (toll free in the USA & Canada).

**Europe, Middle East, and Africa:** Email: [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com); Tel: +44 (0) 1865 778315.

**Asia Pacific:** Email: [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com); Tel: +65 6511 8000.

**Japan:** For Japanese speaking support, Email: [cs-japan@wiley.com](mailto:cs-japan@wiley.com); Tel: +65 6511 8010 or Tel (tollfree): 005 316 50 480.

**Visit our Online Customer Help** available in 7 languages at <https://hub.wiley.com/community/support/onlinelibrary>

**Mailing.** Periodical postage paid at Hoboken, New Jersey, and additional offices. Postmaster: Send address changes to *Zygon*, John Wiley & Sons Inc., C/O The Sheridan Press, PO Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331.

**Delivery Terms and Legal Title.** Where the subscription price includes print issues and delivery is to the recipient’s address, delivery terms are Delivered at Place (DAP); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Title to all issues transfers FOB our shipping point, freight prepaid. We will endeavour to fulfil claims for missing or damaged copies within six months of publication, within our reasonable discretion and subject to availability.

*Printed in the USA by The Sheridan Group*